

Intermediate Care Site options appraisal

Property		Benbow III	Martin House	Queensmead II	Southfields / Newry	Tilling Road	
1	Shape & size of site <i>Minimum 6,000 m²</i>	Comments	12,498 m ² remaining for phases II and III. Phase II will utilise approx 4,000 m ² leaving approx 8,000 m ² for dementia. Regularity of phase III site will be dependent on layout for phase II.	6147 m ² without cottage, 6416 m ² with. Irregular shape.	15,840 m ² in total. Phase I development likely to take up one third of site leaving approximately 10,000 m ² . Regular shape but design and layout of phase I currently unknown.	Southfields 6,525 m ² . Newry 5,772 m ² . Both regular shape.	6,073 m ² of regular shape with Goodacre offering more capacity (6,644 m ²).
		Initial score	4	3	5	4	4
		Weighting	5	5	5	5	5
		Weighted score	20	15	25	20	20
2	Room for possible future expansion	Comments	No.	Very limited room for expansion if Cottage can be secured.	Yes.	Yes, if both sites available.	Yes, adjoining council owned land.
		Initial score	2	3	3	3	5
		Weighting	3	3	3	3	3
		Weighted score	6	9	9	9	15
3	Location <i>Distance from City Centre (Clocktower)</i>	Comments					
		Initial score	1	2	3	1	2
		Weighting	5	5	5	5	5
		Weighted score	5	10	15	5	10
4	Ease of access <i>Main road & bus routes / stops</i> <i>Score minimum 3</i>	Comments					
		Initial score	4	5	4	5	4
		Weighting	5	5	5	5	5
		Weighted score	20	25	20	25	20
5	Access to healthcare - 1 <i>Distance to nearest GP</i>	Comments					
		Initial score	2	2	2	3	5
		Weighting	2	2	2	2	2
		Weighted score	4	4	4	6	10
6	Access to healthcare - 2 <i>Distance to nearest Pharmacy</i>	Comments					
		Initial score	2	3	1	5	4

Appendix C

		Weighting	2	2	2	2	2
		Weighted score	4	6	2	10	8
7	Site environment <i>Neighbouring use & noise</i>	Comments	Residential area. Limited local services.	Residential area close to existing facilities for older people and the Allandale Rd / Francis St shopping area. Very quiet with pleasant grounds.	Residential area. Limited local services.	Residential area, close to local shops and facilities.	Residential area in close proximity to services at Home Farm Square. Adjacent land likely to be future residential development. Quiet.
		Initial score	3	5	3	5	5
		Weighting	5	5	5	5	5
		Weighted score	15	25	15	25	25
8	Availability/other interest	Comments	The first phase of Benbow was provided by an RSL putting in infrastructure and affordable housing. Potential for remainder to be sold for private housing but no market interest. Recently funding approved for RSL to build a second phase comprising 17 units. Remainder of site available.	Existing Day Centre closed in 2013 but occupiers of first floor office accommodation would need to be relocated.	Former school site, now cleared and recently an RSL has been funded to provide a first phase of development on the site of 20 houses. Required to be completed by March 2015. Remainder of site available for development, assumption would be sale for housing.	The Southfields site is currently vacant and has been through school closure process. It is currently not being looked at for future school provision. The Newry is occupied by S BSS (Secondary Behavioural Support Service) and use would require their relocation. Formal school closure would also be needed.	Former Butterwick EPH demolished some years ago leaving cleared site. This option assumes utilisation of adjacent Goodacre House site/properties which are on the ASC portfolio but currently being used by Housing for short term lets. This arrangement can cease on a maximum of six months notice leaving current buildings requiring demolition.
		Initial score	4	4	4	3	5
		Weighting	3	3	3	3	3
		Weighted score	12	12	12	9	15

Appendix C

9	Restrictions on development	Comments	Site has had outline consent for residential development, 47 units in phases II and III in total. Underground holding tank on frontage to be incorporated as part of green space.	Site in conservation area with known TPO's. Tenant with secure tenancy in the Cottage.	The development would need to link into first phase above and pay a share of infrastructure costs.	Existing user in the Newry.	None
		Initial score	4	2	3	3	5
		Weighting	4	4	4	4	4
		Weighted score	16	8	12	12	20
10	Site Valuation	Comments	Restricted information	Restricted information	Restricted information	Restricted information	Restricted information
		Initial score	5	1	3	4	3
		Weighting	2	2	2	2	2
		Weighted score	10	2	6	8	6
11	Deliverability risks	Comments	Main risk is whether there will be sufficient land left in phase III, and if so whether it will be the right shape for the development as second phase design and layout not yet in place.	Requires closure of existing Day Centre and office accommodation. May also require negotiations with secure tenant if Cottage is to be included.	Need to link with phase I development for which design and layout not yet determined.	Part occupied site. Demolition required.	Site is cleared (apart from Goodacre) and available for development.
		Initial score	2	3	3	2	4
		Weighting	5	5	5	5	5
		Weighted score	10	15	15	10	20

	Benbow III	Martin House	Queensmead II	Southfields / Newry	Tilling Road
Total	122	131	135	139	169

Tilling Road	169	0
Southfields / Newry	139	30

Appendix C

Queensmead II	135	34
Martin House	131	38
Benbow III	122	47

Critical criteria

Sites included in original appraisal but later ruled out as failed to meet critical criteria

1. Herrick Lodge
Failed critical criteria for "site size" of 6 000m² (only 5,210m²) and "ease of access" minimum standard of 3 (scored 2)
2. Manor Farm
Failed criteria for "ease of access" minimum standard of 3 (scored 2)
3. John Ellis
Failed criteria for "ease of access" minimum standard of 3 (scored 2)
4. Douglas Bader
Failed critical criteria for "site size" minimum standard of 6,000m² (only 4,359m²)